



ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 25 N 1678

Date: 2009-08-11

Replaces ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 25 N/A

| |
|--|
| <p style="text-align: center;">ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 25 INTERCONNECTION OF INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY EQUIPMENT Secretariat: Germany (DIN)</p> |
|--|

DOC TYPE: Voting report

TITLE: Summary of Voting on Document JTC 1 N 9574/ SC 25 N 1649:
NWIP for ISO/IEC 15045-2: Information Technology – Home
Electronic System (HES) Gateway – Part 2: Modularity and
Protocol

SOURCE: ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 25 Secretary

PROJECT: 25.01.03.04

STATUS: After time out for a similar project that had been approved in 2004
a 2nd proposal for new work on this subject has been distributed
with SC 25 N 1649 and JTC 1 N 9574.
Work on this project has been approved subject to confirmation
by the SC 25 plenary as recorded in this document.
Considering the comments received such work needs to be done in
close co-ordination with IEC TC 100 and possibly other ongoing
work on this subject. Appropriate procedures shall be specified at
the next plenary of SC 25, Beijing, 2009-09-11.

ACTION ID: FYI

DUE DATE: N/A

REQUESTED: For information to the member bodies of SC 25

ACTION: For consideration at the SC 25 plenary, Beijing, 2009-09-11.

MEDIUM: Def

DISTRIBUTION: ITTF, JTC 1 Secretariat
P-, L-, O-Members of SC 25

No of Pages: 4 (including cover)

**Voting summary of ISO/IEC JTC 1 9574/ 25 N 1649: NWIP for ISO/IEC 15045-2:
Information Technology – Home Electronic System (HES) Gateway –
Part 2: Modularity and Protocol**

| 'P' Members | Q.1 | Q.2 | Q.3 | Q.4 | Q.5 | Q.6 | Comment |
|------------------------|------------|------------|------------|------------|------------|------------|--|
| Australia | YES | YES | YES | NO | NO | NO | |
| Austria | YES | YES | NO | NO | NO | NO | |
| Belgium | NO | NO | NO | NO | NO | NO | Q1, 2 |
| Canada | YES | YES | YES | NO | NO | NO | Q. 1, 3 |
| China | <i>YES</i> | <i>YES</i> | <i>YES</i> | <i>NO</i> | <i>NO</i> | <i>NO</i> | 1 st invalid, 2 nd Late, not counted |
| Czech Rep. | YES | YES | NO | NO | NO | NO | |
| Denmark | YES | YES | NO | NO | NO | NO | |
| Finland | YES | YES | NO | NO | NO | NO | |
| France | YES | NO | NO | NO | NO | NO | Q. 2 |
| Germany | YES | NO | NO | NO | NO | NO | Q. 2 |
| India | | | | | | | |
| Ireland | | | | | | | |
| Israel | | | | | | | |
| Italy | NO | NO | NO | NO | NO | NO | Q. 1, 2 |
| Japan | YES | YES | YES | NO | NO | NO | |
| Kazakhstan | | | | | | | |
| Korea Rep. | <i>YES</i> | <i>YES</i> | <i>YES</i> | <i>NO</i> | <i>NO</i> | <i>NO</i> | Late not counted |
| Lebanon | | | | | | | |
| Mexico | YES | YES | YES | NO | NO | NO | |
| Netherlands | YES | NO | NO | NO | NO | NO | |
| New Zealand | | | | | | | |
| Norway | | | | | | | |
| Poland | | | | | | | |
| Singapore | YES | YES | NO | NO | NO | NO | |
| Spain | Abstain | Abstain | Abstain | Abstain | Abstain | Abstain | |
| Sweden | YES | NO | NO | NO | NO | NO | Q.2 |
| Switzerland | YES | YES | NO | NO | NO | NO | Q.2 |
| UK | | | | | | | Invalid |
| USA | YES | YES | YES | YES | YES | YES | Q. 4 |
| Yes | 15 | 11 | 5 | 1 | 1 | 1 | |
| No | 2 | 6 | 12 | 16 | 16 | 16 | |
| Abstention | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | |

Comments received on ISO/IEC JTC 1/ 25 N 1649: NWIP for ISO/IEC 15045-2: Information Technology – Home Electronic System (HES) Gateway – Part 2: Modularity and Protocol

| Question | ID | Comment | Proposed change | SC 25 Secretary's observations |
|----------|---------|---|-----------------|---|
| 1 | Belgium | The project has already started 3 times and it was always voted down. There are no new elements thus there is no need to make a new work without any probability of success. Moreover, there are other groups working on the subject. The proposal is to wait the outcome of this work. | | The failure of the first attempt to produce this document shall be taken as an indication that the second attempt needs to be significantly different to the first. |
| 1 | Canada | So far all the links and channels specified within ISO/IEC JTC1/SC 25 are faulty, as they are not consistent and require absolutely a revision. This problem does not only affect ISO/IEC JTC1/SC 25, but also IEC TC46 WG9. In fact the part concerning the cables has been addressed already with IEC SC46C and will be corrected there. Our vote is subject to the willingness of ISO/IEC JTC1/SC 25 here WG1 to also revise and correct their channel and link requirements. | | Either there is a mix up of documents or more detailed change requests are needed. |
| 1 | Italy | The HG model proposed doesn't reflect the state of the art of a fast evolving market. Previously rejected drafts on the same topic give clear indications. | | See observation to Belgium comment to question 1 |
| 2 | Belgium | The project has already started 3 times and it was always voted down. There are no new elements thus there is no need to make a new work without any probability of success. Moreover, there are other groups working on the subject. The proposal is to wait the outcome of this work. | | See observation to Belgium comment to question 1 |
| 2 | France | The added value of this document is not obvious. It contains only generalities that moreover do not reflect the state of the art. Working on this project would be cost-un-efficient. In case the project would be added in the program of work, it should be a TR, not an IS. | | This observation is supported by the progress made with the first attempt to develop this document as well as the voting result on SC 25 N 1651. |

| | | | | |
|---|-------------|---|---|---|
| 2 | Germany | Coordination with IEC TC 100 TA9 work in progress required | | Practical ways for coordination with IEC TC 100 shall be specified at the next plenary of SC 25. |
| 2 | Italy | Inputs from other initiatives (eg. HGI) need to be examined to evaluate if a stable HG model could be defined at this moment in time. | | Further details could be helpful. |
| 2 | Sweden | Similar project already started in IEC TC100 | Support the project in IEC TC 100 TA9 (IEC 62514) | IEC 62514 will be distributed with SC 25 N 1679. |
| 2 | Switzerland | Coordination with IEC TC 100 TA9 work in progress required | | See observation to German comment on question 2. |
| 3 | Canada | Commenting only | | Noted |
| 4 | USA | Dr Timothy Schoechele | | Noted as well as the fact that this is the same gentleman under whose responsibility the first attempt to develop this document failed. |

Comments received on ISO/IEC JTC 1 9574: NWIP for ISO/IEC 15045-2: Information Technology – Home Electronic System (HES) Gateway – Part 2: Modularity and Protocol

| Question | ID | Comment | JTC 1 Secretary's instruction | SC 25 Secretary's observations |
|----------|---------|---|--|---|
| 2 | Germany | Coordination with IEC TC 100 TA9 work in progress required | The comment shall be considered by SC 25 | The subject shall be considered by SC 25 plenary |
| 2 | Canada | Canada supports this NWIP on modularity and protocol development with the following provision. This approval is based upon the expectation that ISO/IEC JTC1/SC25 WG3 is willing and ready to change and correct their absolutely faulty link and channel limit setting procedures for all their network protocols, using well established physical/mathematical procedures. | The comment shall be considered by SC 25 | In case Canada confirms that this comment concerns document JTC 1 N 9574/ SC 25 N 1649 it shall be considered by SC 25 plenary. |